



05-4506832



pustaka.upsi.edu.my



Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun
Kampus Sultan Abdul Jalil Shah



PustakaTBainun



ptbupsi

AN EVALUATION OF A UNIVERSITY BILINGUAL EDUCATION PROGRAM USING THE CONTEXT, INPUT, PROCESS, AND PRODUCT (CIPP) MODEL IN YOGYAKARTA, INDONESIA



05-4506832



pustaka.upsi.edu.my



Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun



PustakaTBainun



ptbupsi

RAUDHATUL HAURA

SULTAN IDRIS EDUCATION UNIVERSITY
2024



05-4506832



pustaka.upsi.edu.my



Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun
Kampus Sultan Abdul Jalil Shah



PustakaTBainun



ptbupsi



05-4506832



pustaka.upsi.edu.my



Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun
Kampus Sultan Abdul Jalil Shah



PustakaTBainun



ptbupsi

AN EVALUATION OF A UNIVERSITY BILINGUAL EDUCATION PROGRAM
USING THE CONTEXT, INPUT, PROCESS, AND PRODUCT (CIPP)
MODEL IN YOGYAKARTA, INDONESIA

RAUDHATUL HAURA



05-4506832



pustaka.upsi.edu.my



Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun
Kampus Sultan Abdul Jalil Shah



PustakaTBainun



ptbupsi

THESIS PRESENTED TO QUALIFY FOR A DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND COMMUNICATION
SULTAN IDRIS EDUCATION UNIVERSITY

2024



05-4506832



pustaka.upsi.edu.my



Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun
Kampus Sultan Abdul Jalil Shah



PustakaTBainun



ptbupsi



Please tick (✓)
Project Paper
Masters by Research
Master by Mixed Mode
PhD

✓

INSTITUTE OF GRADUATE STUDIES

DECLARATION OF ORIGINAL WORK

This declaration is made on the 10 day of September 2024

i. Student's Declaration

I, Raudhatul Haura, P201152002301, Faculty of Languages and Communication hereby declare that the work entitled An Evaluation of a University Bilingual Education Program Using the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) Model in Yogyakarta, Indonesia is my original work. I have not copied from any other students' work or from any other sources except where due reference or acknowledgement is made explicitly in the text, nor has any part been written for me by another person.

Signature of the student

ii. Supervisor's Declaration:

I Charanjit Kaur D/O Swaran Singh hereby certifies that the work entitled An Evaluation of a University Bilingual Education Program Using the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) Model in Yogyakarta, Indonesia was prepared by the above named student, and was submitted to the Institute of Graduate Studies as a * partial/full fulfillment for the conferment of Doctor of Philosophy, and the aforementioned work, to the best of my knowledge, is the said student's work.

10 September 2024

Date

Signature of the Supervisor
Prof. Dr. Charanjit Kaur D/O Swaran Singh
Timbalan Dekan (Akademik dan Antarabangsa)
Fakulti Bahasa dan Komunikasi
Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris



**INSTITUT PENGAJIAN SISWAZAH /
INSTITUTE OF GRADUATE STUDIES**

**BORANG PENGESAHAN PENYERAHAN TESIS/DISERTASI/LAPORAN KERTAS PROJEK
DECLARATION OF THESIS/DISSERTATION/PROJECT PAPER FORM**

Tajuk / Title: An Evaluation of a University Bilingual Education Program Using the
Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) Model in Yogyakarta, Indonesia

No. Matrik /Matric's No.: P20152002301

Saya / I : Raudhatul Haura

(Nama pelajar / Student's Name)

mengaku membenarkan Tesis/Disertasi/Laporan Kertas Projek (Kedoktoran/Sarjana)*
ini disimpan di Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris (Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun)
dengan syarat-syarat kegunaan seperti berikut:-
acknowledged that Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris (Tuanku Bainun Library) reserves the right as follows:-

1. Tesis/Disertasi/Laporan Kertas Projek ini adalah hak milik UPSI.
The thesis is the property of Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris
2. Perpustakaan Tuanku Bainun dibenarkan membuat salinan untuk tujuan rujukan dan penyelidikan.
Tuanku Bainun Library has the right to make copies for the purpose of reference and research.
3. Perpustakaan dibenarkan membuat salinan Tesis/Disertasi ini sebagai bahan pertukaran antara Institusi Pengajian Tinggi.
The Library has the right to make copies of the thesis for academic exchange.
4. Sila tandakan (✓) bagi pilihan kategori di bawah / Please tick (✓) for category below:-

☐ **SULIT/CONFIDENTIAL**

Mengandungi maklumat yang berdarjah keselamatan atau kepentingan Malaysia seperti yang termaktub dalam Akta Rahsia Rasmi 1972. / Contains confidential information under the Official Secret Act 1972

☐ **TERHAD/RESTRICTED**

Mengandungi maklumat terhad yang telah ditentukan oleh organisasi/badan di mana penyelidikan ini dijalankan. / Contains restricted information as specified by the organization where research was done.

☒ **TIDAK TERHAD / OPEN ACCESS**

Raudhatul Haura

(Tandatangan Pelajar/Signature)

Tarikh: 03 July 2024

Cheng

(Tandatangan Penyeja / Signature of Supervisor)
& (Nama & Cop Rasmi / Name & Official Stamp)

Prof. Madya Li Chuanpin, Raudhatul Haura, Suvaran Singh
Timbalan Dekan (Akademik dan Antarabangsa)
Fakulti Bahasa dan Komunikasi
Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris

Catatan: Jika Tesis/Disertasi ini **SULIT@ TERHAD**, sila lampirkan surat daripada pihak berkuasa/organisasi berkenaan dengan menyatakan sekali sebab dan tempoh laporan ini perlu dikelaskan sebagai **SULIT** dan **TERHAD**.

Notes: If the thesis is **CONFIDENTIAL** or **RESTRICTED**, please attach with the letter from the organization with period and reasons for confidentiality or restriction.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Alhamdulillah rabil ‘alamin, the researcher expresses his highest gratitude to Allah subhanahu wa ta’ala for blessing, love, opportunity, health, and mercy to complete this dissertation. Sholawat also goes to our lord Prophet Muhammad SAW who has brought us from darkness to enlightenment and read the truth for mankind.

In arranging this dissertation, a lot of people have provided motivation. The reseaecher would like to express gratitude and gratitude profusely to my Husband, daughter, son, grandson, sisters, family and friends who always pray for me, encourage and contribute in any form, may Allah SWT repay by bestowing his blessings on all of us, Amen.

To the first supervisor, Associate Professor DR. Charanjit Kaur Swaran Singh. I would like to thank you very much for being very patient in helping me in completing this dissertation, who generously gave advice, prayers, guidance, corrections, suggestion and encouragement which greatly helped the completion of my dissertation. I belive without her this dissertation would never have been completed.

The researcher realizes that this dissertation is still far from perfect, therefore suggestions and criticisms are needed so that this dissertation can make a good contribution to researcher, related parties and readers.



ABSTRACT

The aim of the research is to ascertain the effectiveness of the Bilingual Education Program using the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) Model. The objectives are to evaluate the Bilingual Education Program using the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) Model, identify the strengths and weaknesses of the program and suggest ways to improve it. The Bilingual Education Program was implemented in an International Class at the Faculty of Economics and Business. The qualitative research approach was employed. The purposive sampling techniques were utilised involving the Dean of the Faculty of Economics and Business, two lecturers who were involved in teaching in the International Class, five students in the International Class, and alumni members. Data obtained from the classroom observation, semi-structured interviews, and document analysis were analysed using thematic analysis. The findings showed that in real practice, lecturers could successfully run the Bilingual Learning program well that can be seen from the context, input, process, and product components. The advantages the students obtained are: it gives a habit to always use English in Indonesia, it helps the students to be more proficient to use English, it helps the students to enrich their vocabulary, it gives chance to the students to join study abroad, and it gives new information and knowledge to the students. The conclusion of the study suggested the strength of the program includes students' enthusiasm, adequate facilities, and the chance for students to join study abroad. While the weaknesses including the provision of the material the lecturers gave in the Bilingual Learning program was still lacking, students were found it difficult to speak English in daily. The implications of this study show that all the participants have positive perspectives about the program and acknowledged the benefits accrued. Nonetheless, there were some shortcomings for which suggestions for improvement were made. This study contributes valuable insights into the areas needing enhancement to maximize the program's effectiveness.





PENILAIAN PROGRAM PENDIDIKAN DWIBAHASA UNIVERSITI MENGUNAKAN MODEL KONTEKS, INPUT, PROSES, DAN PRODUK (CIPP) DI YOGYAKARTA, INDONESIA.

ABSTRAK

Kajian ini bertujuan untuk memastikan keberkesanan Program Pendidikan Dwibahasa dari aspek kekuatan dan kelemahan program dan mencadangkan cara untuk memperbaikinya. Objektif kajian ini adalah untuk menilai Program Pendidikan Dwibahasa menggunakan Model Konteks, Input, Proses dan Produk (CIPP) dalam Program Pendidikan Dwibahasa di Fakulti Ekonomi dan Perniagaan, Indonesia. Reka bentuk kajian ini merupakan kajian kualitatif menerusi kajian kes dalam mengumpul dan menganalisis data. Data diperoleh melalui temu bual, pemerhatian dan analisis dokumen. Sampel kajian yang terlibat daripada seorang Dekan Fakulti Ekonomi dan Perniagaan, dua orang pensyarah yang terlibat dalam pengajaran di Kelas Antarabangsa, lima orang pelajar di Kelas Antarabangsa, dan ahli alumni. Dapatan kajian menunjukkan bahawa dalam amalan sebenar, pensyarah dapat menjalankan program Pembelajaran Dwibahasa dengan jayanya yang boleh dilihat daripada konteks, input, proses, dan komponen produk. Kelebihan yang diperolehi oleh pelajar termasuklah memberi tabiat untuk sentiasa menggunakan Bahasa Inggeris dan Indonesia, membantu pelajar untuk lebih mahir menggunakan Bahasa Inggeris, membantu pelajar memperkaya perbendaharaan kata mereka, memberi peluang kepada pelajar untuk mengikuti pengajian di luar negara, dan ia memberi maklumat dan pengetahuan baharu kepada pelajar. Kekuatan program ini termasuk keghairahan pelajar, kemudahan yang mencukupi, dan peluang untuk pelajar menyertai pengajian di luar negara. Walaupun kelemahan termasuk penyediaan bahan yang diberikan oleh pensyarah dalam program Pembelajaran Dwibahasa masih kurang, pelajar didapati sukar untuk berbahasa Inggeris dalam setiap hari. Kesimpulan kajian ini mendapati semua ahli mempunyai perspektif yang positif tentang program ini dan menyedari manfaat yang diperolehi. Implikasi kajian ini memberi impak kepada program Pendidikan antarabangsa untuk menambah baik kandungan program kepada pendekatan yang lebih komprehensif.





TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
DECLARATION OF ORIGINAL WORK	ii
DECLARATION OF THESIS FORM	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	iv
ABSTRACT	v
ABSTRAK	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xii
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
LIST OF APPENDIXES	xvi
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background of the study	1
1.3 The Bilingual Education Program	4
1.4 Statement of the Problem	10
1.5 Rationale of the Study	11
1.6 Purpose of the Study	13
1.7 Research Objectives	18
1.8 Research Questions	18
1.9 Significance of the Study	18
1.10 Summary	20





CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction	22
2.2 Conceptual Framework	22
2.2.1 Bilingual	23
2.2.2 Bilingualism	27
2.3 Bilingual Education	33
2.4 Aims of Bilingual Education	35
2.5 Bilingual Learning Approach	37
2.6 Bilingual Education Program	41
2.6.1 Transitional Bilingual Education or Early Exit Model	42
2.6.2 Submersion (Structured Immersion)	43
2.6.3 Submersion with Simplified English/pull out/withdrawal	43
2.6.4 Mainstream Education with Foreign Language Teaching	44
2.6.5 Separatist Education	44
2.6.6 Segregationist Education	45
2.6.7 Dual Language Bilingual Education	45
2.6.8 Heritage Language Bilingual Education	46
2.6.9 Immersion Bilingual Education	46
2.6.10 Mainstream Bilingual Education in Majority Languages	46
2.7 Program Evaluation	49
2.8 Use of Evaluation	52
2.9 Formative Evaluation	53
2.10 Summative Evaluation	54
2.11 Program Evaluation Model	55
2.11.1 Goal-oriented Evaluation Model	56



2.11.2 Goal-free Evaluation Model	57
2.12 Formative-summative Evaluation Model	57
2.13 Countenance Evaluation Model	58
2.14 Responsive Evaluation	59
2.15 CIPP Evaluation Model	59
2.16 Context, Input, Process and Product Evaluation	61
2.17 The CIPP Evaluation Model for Education	64
2.17.1 Context Evaluation	65
2.17.2 Input Evaluation	66
2.17.3 Process Evaluation	67
2.17.4 Product Evaluation	68
2.18 The CIPP Model's Formative and Summative Orientation	69
2.19 Usefulness of the CIPP Model	71
2.20 Theoretical Framework	73
2.20.1 Theories Related to Curriculum and Syllabus	74
2.20.2 Curriculum, Syllabus and Course Design	77
2.20.2.1 Curriculum Design	77
2.20.2.2 Syllabus Design	78
2.20.2.3 Course Design	79
2.21 Course Design for Language Learning	81
2.22 Theories Related to Program Evaluation	82
2.22.1 Reductionist Theory	82
2.22.2 Complexity Theory	82
2.23 Review of Related Studies	84

2.24 Research Studies on Bilingual Education Program	85
2.25 Research Studies on the use of the CIPP model	143

CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction	161
3.2 Research Design	161
3.3 Institutional Setting	167
3.4 Participants	168
3.5 Data Collection Methods	169
3.6 Semi-Structured Interviews	170
3.7 Questions Related to Context	172
3.8 Questions Related to Input	173
3.9 Questions Related to Process	173
3.10 Questions Related to Product	173
3.11 Framework for the Interview Questions	175
3.12 Document Analysis	178
3.13 Observations	179
3.14 Procedures for Data Collection	180
3.15 Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research	182
3.15.1 Credibility	183
3.15.1.1 Triangulation	183
3.15.2 Transferability	185
3.15.3 Dependability	186
3.15.4 Confirmability	187
3.16 Extensive Responding	188
3.17 Referential Adequacy	189

3.18 Translation	190
3.19 Pilot Study	191
3.20 Data Analysis Procedures	194
3.21 Thematic Analysis	194
3.22 Data Analysis Process	197
3.22.1 Data Reduction	198
3.22.2 Data Representation	199
3.22.3 Drawing Conclusion and Verification	199
3.23 Limitation of the Research	201

CHAPTER 4 DATA ANALYSIS AND RESULT

4.1 Introduction	202
4.2 Data Analysis	204
4.3 Findings	213
4.4 Successful Effectiveness of Bilingual Learning Program in One of State University Yogyakarta, Indonesia	214
4.4.1 Context Evaluation	216
4.4.2 Input Evaluation	218
4.4.3 Process Evaluation	219
4.4.4 Product Evaluation	221
4.5 Research Question 1	222
4.5.1 Context Evaluation	223
4.5.2 Input Evaluation	247
4.5.3 Process Evaluation	281
4.5.4 Product Evaluation	309
4.5.5 Summary	315

4.6 Research Question 2	316
4.6.1 Context	318
4.6.2 Input	320
4.6.3 Process	323
4.6.4 Product	325
4.6.5 The Strength and Weakness of Bilingual Learning Program	326
4.6.6 The Strength of Bilingual Learning Program	327
4.6.7 The Weakness of Bilingual Learning Program	328
4.7 Research Question 3	329
4.7.1 The Advantage of the Bilingual Learning Program	334
4.8 Data Triangulation	335

CHAPTER 5 DISCUSSION

5.1 Introduction	336
5.2 Discussion	337
5.3 Summary	343

CHAPTER 6 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Introduction	346
6.2 Conclusions	347
6.2.1 The Extent of the Setting of the Bilingual Learning Program	347
6.2.2 The Extent of the Input Process of the Bilingual Learning Program	351
6.2.3 The Extent of the Implementation Process of the Bilingual Learning Program	358
6.2.4 Degree of Which Graduates Produced by the Bilingual Learning Program Meet the Needs and Expectations of the Stakeholder	362

6.3 Drawing from the Study’s Findings and the Preceding Chapter’s talks	364
6.4 Future Research Recommendations	365
6.5 Summary	366
REFERENCES	370
APPENDIX	385

LIST OF TABLES

Table No.		Page
2.1	The Relevance of 4 Evaluation to Improvement and Accountability	69
3.1	Data Collection and Analysis Methods	169
4.1	Interview with the Dean (Appendix B)	206
4.2	Interview with the Lecturers (Appendix C)	207
4.3	Interview with the Students (Appendix D)	209
4.4	Interview with the Alumni (Appendix E)	212

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure No.		Page
4.1	Basic Curriculum Framework	230



LIST OF APPENDIXES

A	Core Course (Silabus)
B	Interview With Dean
C	Interview With Lecturers
D	Interview With Students
E	Interview With Alumni
F	Observation Sheet



CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the background of the study, an Introduction to the bilingual education program, statement of the problem, rationale of the study, the purpose, research objectives, the research questions, significance of the study, the definition of terms, and a summary.

1.2 Background of the Study

Indonesia is the home to several local languages. There are about 710 languages (David Eberhard, Gary Simons, and Charles Fenning, 2020) spoken in the country. Most of the people in Indonesia speak at least two languages which are Indonesian and a local language.

Historically, Indonesia was not spared from the yoke of colonial powers. The Dutch colonized the country since the early 1600s for more than three and a half centuries. The Japanese took over power in 1942. At the end of the second world war, Indonesia was returned to the Indonesian people and the country received its



independence in 1945. Although foreign powers had ruled the country over a period of time, there was no permanent influence left by them in terms of language use or education.

During the Dutch rule, only the elites received education in Dutch (Hoffman, 1979). Hence the Dutch language was not widely used. The Indonesian Malay language was recognized by the Dutch as a second language and it was used for trade and administrative purposes alongside the Dutch language. This marked the beginning of bilingualism in Indonesia.

During the Japanese occupation attempts were made to establish the Japanese language for administrative and educational purposes. However, the attempt was unsuccessful due to the short period of Japanese occupation. Hence the Indonesian language thrived to be the national language and was used for administrative as well as educational purposes and it still is until today.

However, globalization has changed the scenario with the infiltration of other foreign languages, such as English, German, and Arabic (Nababan, 1991). Globalization has transformed the world in many aspects, one of which is education. It has brought closer contacts among nations and nationalities. These nations have become more interconnected and interdependent. Hence, it is inevitable that communication using a common language among different nations would rise. In the case of Indonesia, there is a need to master a foreign language which would help its citizens to cope with and to take advantage of developments in other parts of the world. Knowledge, skills and intellectual assets can be acquired by interacting with more developed countries.





In Indonesia, the provision for the use a foreign language can be cited from Article 33 (3) (Act of The Republic of Indonesia on National Education System, Number 20, Year 2003) which states that “A foreign language can be used as a medium of instruction to support the competency of the learners” (p.20).

Although Indonesia was colonized by the Dutch and later, the Japanese, neither the Dutch nor the Japanese language was used formally in educational settings. English was considered to be a language of international importance since the United States of America and the United Kingdom were the dominant political powers at that time. Hence the preference for English was made for its inclusion in the national education curriculum. Nababan (1991) termed it the ‘first foreign language’ (p. 120).



right up to tertiary level was English (Dardjowidjojo, 1998; Nababan, 1991). Compared to Dutch and Japanese, English was described as a more important language for world science and knowledge (Alisjahbana, 1974). Between 1967 and 1998, the official status of English was established through the Presidential Decree No. 28/1990. English was made a compulsory subject in secondary schools. Hence English became the second language for those who spoke only the Indonesian language, and a third language for those who spoke both the Indonesian language and an indigenous language. English flourished in Indonesia with the help of certain foundations which provided funds as well as training. In 1953, a number of teachers underwent professional development through the In-Service Teacher Training Project funded by the Ford Foundation (Dardjowidjojo, 2000). Other providers which helped in the training of English teachers included the British Council, the American-Indonesian Exchange Foundation, and the



Colombo Plan Scheme aided by Australia and also New Zealand (Zein, Sukyadi, Abdul Hamid, & Lengkanawati, 2020). During this period, many universities used English to teach various content area subjects.

Until today, the English language plays an important role in the education sector in Indonesia. Since English is a language that is used world-wide, it is assumed that knowledge of that language will enable students to benefit from it by obtaining better achievement and social status (Hapsari, 2012).

Today, English language education has shown an upward trend at three levels of education in Indonesia. They are the primary level (Zein, 2017), the secondary level (Putra and Lukmana (2017) and tertiary level (Dewi, 2017). English is taught as a subject in schools as well as at institutions of higher education. The Education Act of 2003 also acknowledges English and Indonesian language as a medium of instruction in schools as well as higher education level. At tertiary level, English has been used as a medium of instruction through bilingual education programs since 2003 (Abduh and Rosmaladewi, 2019). English is used alongside the Indonesian language to teach content area subjects.

1.3 The Bilingual Education Program

Bilingualism, or the capacity to master both the first and second languages, is thought to have a number of benefits, including the ability to converse with others who speak the second language, opportunities to learn it verbally and in writing, and enhanced



cognitive abilities. The ability to learn the first language is simple, but the ability to master the second language is more challenging. For a very long time, people have believed that education is a good way to learn a second language. Because of this, the use of education as a tool for second language learning has long been a focus and a source of worry for many educational stakeholders, including governments, teachers, and education experts.

Through its education curricula, the Indonesian government has addressed the problem of second language learning in schools as well as universities. To adapt second language learning to changing contexts, a number of curricula have been devised, assessed, altered, applied, and improved. The current Indonesian curriculum, the 2013 Curriculum (K13), is the culmination of modifications to earlier curricula.

The ability to speak English is viewed as a symbol of modern identity and the mark of an educated person (Renandya, 2004). Abduh and Rosmaladewi's (2019) view regarding the ability of the Indonesians to speak a foreign language is that they can be considered as knowledgeable. These views portray the importance of mastering a foreign language in Indonesia. One way of achieving such aspirations is to implement English and the Indonesian language in bilingual education programs (Abduh & Rosmaladewi, 2019)

Anderson and Boyer (1970) define bilingual education as 'teaching in two languages and the use of those two languages as mediums of instruction for any part of or all of the school curriculum' (p.12). Baker and Prys-Jones (1998) claim that 'bilingual education may be said to start when more than one language is used to teach





content (e.g. Science, Mathematics, Social Sciences, or Humanities) rather than just being taught as a subject by itself' (p. 466).

These two definitions fit well into the Indonesian education context. The legal status of the bilingual education program in Indonesia has allowed various institutions to implement the program. At higher education level, the program is intended to promote universities in Indonesia to be internationally recognized. It is meant to attract international students to universities in Indonesia and also to engender partnership with other accredited and recognized institutions overseas (Setiawati, 2012). The use of English as a medium of instruction from primary education to university level can benefit the students cognitively and socially. It can help students develop their competences in the language concerned (Dewi, 2012). In her research on the use of English in the midst of the Indonesian language, Dewi (2012) discovered that the use of English in higher education helped both the lecturers and students learn western cultures and values. She opined that it did not diminish the importance of the Indonesian language as the national language.

Abduh and Rosmaladewi (2019) agree that students benefit from the use of English in bilingual education programs. Students have the opportunity to practice using English orally as well as in the written form. They are also able to understand current development especially in science and technology. To cope with global communication, it is important for Indonesian people to be bilingual, otherwise, their limited English proficiency will retard their attainment of information (Margana, 2015). Margana expounds that English has become the main concern of developing English speaking countries including Indonesia, as the global language used in various fields such as





technology, education, business, economy, tourism and social affairs. Ellen Bialystock, Fergus I.M. Craik, David W. Green, and Tamar H. Gollan (2009) comment that 'as the world becomes more interconnected, it is increasingly apparent that bilingualism is the rule and not the exception' (p. 89).

Since 1998 until today, bilingual education has been recognized by virtue of the Education Act of 2003 which accepted English and Indonesian language as a medium of instruction and the Law for Higher Education 2012, supported the use of these two languages as the medium of instruction (Abduh & Rosmaladewi, 2019).

The pervasiveness of the English language into the education system of Indonesia gave rise to what Graddol (1998) terms as a 'global-local dilemma' (p.33) which marked the intrusion of 'global values into the local language and cultural context' (Abduh and

Rosmaladewi, 2019, p. 223). Tollefson and Tsui (2004) view this issue as problematic.

Their argument hinges on the idea that to use English appropriately requires understanding of the English culture which may contradict the local culture. Notwithstanding such issues, the trend of bilingualism being realized as English and the Indonesian language persists.

For a number of Indonesian educational institutions, bilingual instruction has become prestigious. The Indonesian government, notably the Department of National Education, has implemented a "bilingual program" in which certain topics are taught in English. The program's goals are to produce graduates who not have a strong command of the English language, but also well-versed in a variety of disciplines.

One initiative that has been taken to establish and maintain a bilingual environment at university level is the setting up of an international class program. This program is





adopted by certain universities in Indonesia. The nature of the program varies from university to university. In some universities, for example Semarang State University, bilingual classes are conducted in some courses, especially educational courses (Melati & Arief, 2015). In other universities, such as State University in Indonesia, an international class program which advocates English and the Indonesian language as media of instruction, is established.

This study focuses on the international class conducted at the Faculty of Economics and Business, at one of State University in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. This faculty aims at enhancing the implementation of teaching and learning using the English language alongside the national language. The courses conducted in this international class are Business and Management, Marketing management, Accounting and Finance, Managerial Economics, Financial management, Marketing Management, Leadership and Organisational Behaviour. The students in this international class are involved in the International Master of Business Administration Program. Evidence of its aims can be seen in the syllabus of each of the content area subjects. The objectives of each course for students to achieve are expressed in the English language. (Appendix A) For example, although the description of the course for Financial Management, which is a core course, is in Indonesian language, the learning goals are stated in English. The learning goals are as follows (Buku Panduan Mahasiswa, 2019/2020, p. 95) (Appendix A):

1. Students demonstrate the ability to communicate in an effective, persuasive, and professional manner.
2. Students demonstrate the ability to translate business knowledge into action.
3. Students demonstrate the ability to make ethical and responsible decisions.



4. Students demonstrate the ability to solve practical business problem with creative ideas.
5. Students demonstrate the ability to be a strategic business leader.

The strategy taken in using English to convey information to students as well as lecturers is evident that the university is serious in exposing the students as well as the lecturers to the use of English alongside the national language, hence implementing bilingualism.

Since its inception, there is hardly any information regarding the efficacy of the bilingual education program conducted in the international class at the Faculty of Economics and Business. Thus, it is felt that an evaluation of the bilingual education program conducted in the international class ought to be made. This proposal is also made because the move to implement a bilingual education program has raised mixed reactions.

According to Tong, Wang, Min, and Tang (2020) in spite of undergoing two decades of research and practice in bilingual education in China there is still lack of evidence to support the effectiveness of bilingual education.

In Indonesia, certain universities recorded an improvement of students English proficiency (Melati & Arief, 2015). However, there is still a dearth of information regarding the overall effectiveness of the bilingual education program at tertiary level in Indonesia. It is with this issue in mind that this study is embarked upon.

1.4 Statement of the Problem

Globalization has prompted educational institutions competing to achieve excellence in terms of knowledge, skills, and values. It has also facilitated international communication and interaction for which a common language is required. The English language is recognized as ‘a medium of international/intercultural communication across lingual borders in the modern everyday life’ (Todorova &Todorova, 2018: 336). To keep abreast with current development and advancement in the educational field, many countries have adopted English as a medium of instruction. Certain educational institutions in Indonesia have accepted English as a medium of instruction. All content subject areas are taught in English while other institutions use English alongside the national language.

Bilingual Education Programs have been introduced all over the world as a result of exposure to English internationally. Indonesia underwent a campaign for curriculum reform in 2007, and one of the modifications that resulted has had a significant impact on bilingual education programs since then. Because economists are in high demand internationally, the Faculty of Economics and Business at one of State University in Indonesia was established to generate graduates of economics. However, many students were unable to obtain positions as economists after graduation. This could be due to one of two factors: (1) The graduates lacked the necessary skills in economics which were in a foreign language; (2) the graduates lacked the mastery of a foreign language.

The issue of a mismatch of skills is viewed as a flaw in the educational institutions' ability to provide human resources that meet business needs (Yogeesvaran, 2005). There are a number of weaknesses, including a lack of fundamental knowledge and competency, communication skills and language fluency, and general knowledge. This could be due to a mismatch in talent provided by higher education institutions or to an inadequate learning environment. According to Maltseva V. (2019), the mismatch of skills implies a discrepancy between the skills the graduates obtained and that of the job requirements. The demand for bilinguals who can conduct business and work in international markets has increased as a result of the increasing integration of global markets. The preparation provided by bilingual education can help our graduates become more involved in these concerns. Additionally, bilingual education enables individuals to access a wider variety of material, improve their communication and teamwork abilities, and develop a broader perspective on the world, all of which are included in the skills necessary for the global workforce.

Even though the bilingual education program is sound in theory in terms of its rigorous and innovative outlook, it is important to conduct this study to assess the strengths and weaknesses of the program. In the university where this study was conducted, up to date, there has thus been no such evaluation.

1.5 Rationale of the study

The government has various ideas to increase the quality of education and produce qualified graduates so that they can keep on achieving better education. Establishing



institutions that adhere to international standards is one of the government's ideas to realize this aspiration. In the year 2003, the national education regulatory system was implemented. The main aim of this system was the creation of high-quality human capital.

Joko Widodo (2019: 1) made clear what he thought was most important for the country. "We want to put our priority on human capital development. Human capital development will be key to Indonesia's future." The skills, abilities, and health that people acquire over the course of their lives are known as human capital. Currently, they are in need of major attention in Indonesia. Therefore, the development of brilliant, applicable, skillful, and creative human resources depends heavily on education. Education will maintain playing a crucial part in the growth and transformation of Indonesia in the coming decade.

In order to realize the aim of the transformation, important measures have been taken by the the Ministry of Higher Education to strengthen quality human resources. Human resources with relevant skills, knowledge, and moral values need to become instruments of reform. Human capital is developed through collaborative initiatives using cutting-edge techniques, particularly within the framework of instruction and learning. The skills of a nation's workforce determine its level of economic competition. The knowledge and abilities of a nation's workforce are influenced by its educational system.

Due to the economic reality in 2020, the demand for knowledge and talented individuals is increasing. A highly knowledgeable and innovative staff generates great



productivity and innovation. To generate high-income human capital, one of the state university in Yogyakarta must improve its system to produce graduates through education and training, to be prepared for an innovation-driven economy. In order to develop creative and innovative graduates, the state university has now included a bilingual education program. World-class knowledgeable workers will be produced as a result of a combination of intellectual and skill prowess, which will propel Indonesia to greater heights.

Currently the state university faces some challenges. The pace of transformation may be slow because of a lack of creative leadership. The system is highly centralized that important information does not filter down efficiently throughout the education system. There is also a dearth of PhD-qualified lecturers to teach the students. The research and development facilities are fairly outmoded, traditional pedagogies are still practised, teaching staff are burdened with heavy teaching loads, industrial links are weak, there is insufficient funding, and poor incentives among the setbacks. Hence, transformation is not possible without graduates who are qualified.

Thus, there is need to conduct this study to evaluate the efficacy of the bilingual education program at the state university and to provide the best output that can be used in real life in order to improve living quality of the stakeholders.

1.6 Purpose of the study

Beginning in 2007, students enrolled in the Bilingual Education Programme at the Faculty of Economics and Business at one of the state universities in Indonesia were



able to begin their four-year bachelor's degree programme. Since that time, there has been no formal feedback collected from students, lecturers, or alumni regarding the relevance, content, effectiveness, or value of the Bilingual Education Programme. As a direct consequence of this, there has been no assessment of the programme. Despite the fact that the primary objective of the Bilingual Education Programme at the University of Economics and Business is to prepare students for careers as professional economists, the programme also aims to improve students' language skills and bring them up to the standards of General English Proficiency and English for International Communication. It would appear that these goals have not been adequately accomplished, despite the significant amount of effort and resources that have been invested. The researcher arrived at this conclusion after conducting casual interviews with a large number of students, alumni, and lecturers who participated in the Bilingual Education Programme at the Faculty of Economics and Business. The researcher made the discovery that the programme does not appear to be producing the results that were desired. In particular, the purpose of this research is to assess the degree to which a bilingual education programme that is based on the CIPP(Context, Input, Process and Product) model is successfully implemented within the Faculty of Economics and Business at one of the state universities in Yogyakarta. The evaluation takes into account the goals and objectives of the programme, as well as the facilities and resources that have an impact on teaching and learning, the teaching-learning processes, and the performance of the students. In order to determine whether or not the implementation of the bilingual education programme is in accordance with the plan and goals for which it was designed, it is necessary to conduct the evaluation.





The purpose of this study is to facilitate the implementation of essential modifications that will contribute to the improvement of the bilingual education programme at the university. This study's objective is to determine whether or not the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model is effective in determining the implementation of the bilingual education programme. There are a number of approaches that can be taken to determine how successful the programme has been; however, the CIPP (Context, Input, Process and Product) model, which takes into consideration the program's context, input, process, and product, is the one that is utilised in this investigation to determine the implementation of the programme.

In this section, the emphasis is placed on the manner in which the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model is utilised to investigate the components that are inherent in each of the CIPP model's aspects. Therefore, a summary of the program's impact on the students' performance would only provide a summative evaluation of the programme; it would not reflect the program's internal operations in any way. In his article, Stufflebeam (2014) asserts that "a fundamental tenet of the CIPP model is that evaluation's purpose is not only to prove but also, more importantly, to improve" (p. 316). It is not possible to obtain a significant amount of useful information for the purpose of programme evaluation by utilising simple and/or aggregate quantitative information or data, as stated by Mihai Lamatic (2011). Consequently, it is essential to employ methods and techniques that are specific to qualitative research (such as surveys, interviews, and so on) in order to collect information and knowledge regarding the qualitative characteristics of programmes, as well as the points of view (perspectives) of participants, implementers, and other individuals who are connected



to the programme. This helps to ensure that the information and knowledge collected is accurate and reliable. (p. 203).

This research intends to get the insiders' views regarding the bilingual education program. It is felt that information from those who are in direct contact with the program and who have experienced it copiously would be valuable in terms of their contribution to the university as well as the society. Measuring the end products alone would not reveal the quality of work that prevails within the program. An examination of the internal workings of the program encompasses not only the educational aspects but also the intercultural and moral values and attitude. Using the performance of students as a criterion in determining the success or failure of the program would only reveal the quality of the product at a moment in time. It would not show the problems and issues related to the internal operations that took place. The quantitative results may show how much students have learned but not how they learned. Hence, in this study, the interactions and interrelationships among the personnel involved and among the facilities and resources will be investigated.

It is envisaged that the Faculty of Economics and Business will benefit from this research, and that the findings will be forwarded to the university for review and execution if deemed appropriate and useful.

For this investigation, the researcher used the CIPP model, proposed by Stufflebeam (2003). It is a basic system for guiding evaluation initiatives. Context evaluation, input evaluation, process evaluation, and product evaluation are the model's fundamental sections. These types of evaluations are commonly thought of as discrete



types of evaluation. However, they can also be viewed as phases or stages of a more comprehensive evaluation. The researcher chose to use them in the latter model. Context evaluation entails analyzing and summarizing the program's context, completing a needs and goals assessment, agreeing on the program's goals, and assessing whether the proposed goals are sufficiently responsive to the identified needs.

According to Stufflebeam (2014: 312) 'in context evaluations, evaluators assess needs, problems, assets, and opportunities, plus relevant contextual conditions and dynamics. Input evaluation involves a description of the program's inputs and resources. In Stufflebeam's (2014), definition, in input evaluations evaluators assist with program planning by identifying and assessing procedural plans, staffing provisions, and budgets for their feasibility and potential cost-effectiveness in regard to meeting the targeted needs and achieving goals' (p.312). Process evaluation refers to the implementation of the program. The performance and activities in the process of teaching and learning are identified and substantiated. Stufflebeam (2014) explains 'in process evaluations, evaluators monitor, document, assess, and report on the implementation of program plans' (p.312). Product evaluation refers to the overall quality and merit of the curriculum and specific outcomes. Stufflebeam's (2014) expresses, 'in product evaluations, evaluators identify and assess costs and outcomes – intended and unintended, short term and long term. They provide feedback during a program's implementation on the extent to which program goals are being addressed and achieved'(p. 312). The evaluation process will be far more summative than formative in nature.

1.7 Research Objectives

1. To examine the effectiveness of the university bilingual education program based on the CIPP model.
2. To identify the strengths and weaknesses of the university bilingual education program.
3. To suggest ways to improve the university bilingual education program.

1.8 Research Questions

1. How effective has the university bilingual program been based on the CIPP model?
2. What are the strengths and weaknesses of the university bilingual education program?
3. How can the university bilingual education program be improved?

1.9 Significance of the study

The current study will benefit the bilingual education class in the Faculty of Economics and Business of the state University at Yogyakarta, Indonesia which was selected for the study. In general, education plays a vital role in producing skillful and innovative human resource, and thus it could develop Indonesia to become robust in the education sector. The bilingual education program implemented will enhance the quality of human

resources especially the Economics and Business graduates in the international class which is a bilingual class. The success of this program will ensure them of good employment opportunities. It will also provide the right motivation for potential students to enroll in the program at the Faculty of Economics and Business.

Furthermore, this study is beneficial to lecturers in higher education. Generally, many teachers and lecturers are accustomed to the regular classroom. They may have the knowledge and skills to teach to teach the content subjects using the Indonesian language. They may lack the skill, knowledge and experience to teach two languages in the bilingual education program class. So, it is hoped that this evaluation on bilingual education program can improve the lecturers' professionalism in Economics and Business subjects as well as their English language competence.

Another important aspect of this research is that it will increase the small corpus of available information about the evaluation of preparatory university programs one of State University in Indonesia. The findings of this study may be used to help other universities figure out what and where their programs are lacking, and perhaps encourage them to pursue similar research undertaking.

The results of this study can set off the impetus for other institutions of higher education to conduct similar studies and subsequently share their results. The initiative will engender amicable cooperation among the institutions involved to alleviate the quality of teaching and learning in general.

It is foreseeable that the results of this will have an impact on the society. Apart from employers who will consider employing graduates of the bilingual education

program, there are parents who would be anxious to know whether or not to enroll their children in such a program. Sources of funds, would be one aspect to ponder as people will consider whether or not to contribute to the continuance of the program when results of the study are disclosed.

Another potential beneficiary of this study is the government, in particular, the Ministry of Education. The results which indicate positive aspects of the program will assist the relevant authorities to plan an education system and policies to meet the needs of the country. There will be emphasis on appropriate needs especially knowledge, skills, and values. The system will pervade throughout the country so that the issue of equity in terms of education can be established.

As this study is qualitative in nature, the findings can provide the momentum for further research to ascertain in quantitative terms the achievement of students exposed to the bilingual education program.

1.10 Summary

This research aims to evaluate a bilingual education program which has been implemented in a bilingual class of the Faculty of Economics and Business at one of the state universities in Indonesia. A bilingual education program (bilingual program or international class) is distinct from non-bilingual learning programs in that it is a constructivism-based, student-centered learning technique that aims to improve students' learning and creativity by allowing them to solve real-world challenges. The



bilingual education program has been implemented at the Faculty of Economics and Business curriculum system at one of the State University in Indonesia since 2007 to develop skills in Economics and Business. However, few studies have evaluated the implementation of the bilingual education program. The CIPP evaluation model is used in this study since it is a complete evaluation approach.

