

**THE IMPACT OF HUMAN RESOURCE PRACTICES ON HUMAN RESOURCE
OUTCOMES OF SMALL AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES IN PAKISTAN**

NAVEED UR REHMAN

**THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENT FOR THE
DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**

**FACULTY OF MANAGEMENT AND ECONOMICS
UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS**

2014

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to investigate the overall influence of the human resource practices that contributes in organizational commitment and human resource outcomes. These practices are of significant value and can play a pivotal role in small and medium enterprises growth. The study is quantitative in nature. Field survey method was used to collect the primary data from 311 small and medium enterprises operating in Karachi, Pakistan. The data was analyzed by using descriptive statistics, correlation, t-test, ANOVA, multiple regression and MANOVA analysis. Findings revealed that human resource practices, organizational commitment and human resource outcomes executed at moderate level in small and medium enterprises. The study reported positive relationship among human resource practices, organizational commitment and human resource outcomes. The analysis also showed that all human resource practices variables are significantly predict the variance in organizational commitment and human resource outcomes. Moreover, the regression results indicated that organizational commitment does not influenced the relationship between human resource practices and human resource outcomes. Overall results suggested that human resource outcomes and organizational commitment are activated by human resource practices. In light of the findings it is cleared that small and medium enterprise owners/managers can maximize the organizational commitment and human resource outcomes through human resource practices. This study reported the impact of human resource practices on organizational commitment and human resource outcomes in small and medium enterprises and hence contributed to existing knowledge by reporting empirical proves. Consequently this study is considered as the pioneering research in context of Pakistan.



KESAN AMALAN SUMBER MANUSIA TERHADAP HASIL SUMBER MANUSIA FIRMA KECIL DAN SEDERHANA DI PAKISTAN

ABSTRAK

Tujuan kajian ini adalah untuk menyiasat pengaruh keseluruhan amalan sumber manusia yang menyumbang dalam komitmen organisasi dan hasil sumber manusia. Amalan-amalan ini mempunyai nilai yang penting dan boleh memainkan peranan penting dalam pertumbuhan perusahaan kecil dan sederhana. Kajian ini adalah kuantitatif dalam alam semula jadi. Kaedah kajian lapangan telah digunakan untuk mengumpul data utama dari 311 perusahaan kecil dan sederhana yang beroperasi di Karachi, Pakistan. Data dianalisis dengan menggunakan statistik deskriptif, korelasi, ujian-t, ANOVA, regresi berganda dan analisis MANOVA. Hasil kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa amalan-amalan sumber manusia, komitmen organisasi dan hasil sumber manusia dilaksanakan pada tahap sederhana dalam perusahaan kecil dan sederhana. Kajian yang dilaporkan hubungan positif di kalangan amalan sumber manusia, komitmen organisasi dan hasil sumber manusia. Analisis juga menunjukkan bahawa semua amalan sumber manusia pembolehubah ketara meramalkan perbezaan dalam komitmen organisasi dan hasil sumber manusia. Selain itu, keputusan regresi menunjukkan bahawa komitmen organisasi tidak dipengaruhi hubungan antara amalan sumber manusia dan hasil sumber manusia. Keputusan keseluruhan menunjukkan bahawa hasil sumber manusia dan komitmen organisasi diaktifkan oleh amalan-amalan sumber manusia. Memandangkan kajian, dijelaskan bahawa pemilik / pengurus perusahaan kecil dan sederhana boleh memaksimumkan komitmen organisasi dan hasil sumber manusia melalui amalan-amalan sumber manusia. Kajian ini melaporkan kesan amalan sumber manusia dalam komitmen organisasi dan hasil sumber manusia dalam perusahaan kecil dan sederhana dan dengan itu menyumbang kepada pengetahuan sedia ada dengan melaporkan empirikal membuktikan. Oleh yang demikian kajian ini dianggap sebagai penyelidikan perintis dalam konteks Pakistan.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page No

DEDICATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	iv
ABSTRACT	v
ABSTRAK	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xvi
LIST OF FIGURES	xxi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xxii

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1	Introduction	2
1.2	Overview of the socio-economic condition of Pakistan	3
1.3	SME sector and Human Resource Practices in Pakistan	5
1.3.1	Small and Medium Scale Firms in Pakistan	5
1.3.1.1	SME categories as per various institutions in Pakistan	9
1.3.2	Employment sector of Pakistan	10

1.3.3	Human Resource Practices in Pakistani SMEs	14
1.4	Background of the study	15
1.5	Problem statement	20
1.6	Objectives of research	24
1.7	Research questions	25
1.8	Hypotheses of the study	26
1.9	Significance of the study	28
1.10	Limitation of the study	30
1.11	Operational definitions	31
1.11.1	Human Resource Practices	31
1.11.1.1	Staffing	31
1.11.1.2	Job design	32
1.11.1.3	Training	32
1.11.1.4	Performance appraisal	32
1.11.1.5	Compensation	33
1.11.1.6	Career planning	33
1.11.2	Organizational commitment	33
1.11.3	Human resource outcomes	34
1.11.4	Small and medium enterprise	34
1.12	Conclusion	35

CHAPTER 2

THE RELATIONSHIP OF HUMAN RESOURCE PRACTICES, ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT AND HR OUTCOMES

2.1	Introduction	37
2.2	Human Resource Practices	39
2.2.1	The philosophy	39
2.2.2	The concepts of HR practices	41
2.2.3	Human Resource Practices and Human Resource Outcomes	43
2.2.4	Theoretical Models of HRM and its Outcomes	45
2.2.5	Empirical Studies on HRM and its Outcomes	50
2.3	Organizational Commitment	55
2.3.1	Basic concepts of Organizational Commitment	55
2.3.2	Human Resource Practices and Organizational Commitment	58
2.3.3	Organizational Commitment and HR Outcomes	60
2.4	Human Resource Practices in Small and Medium Scale Enterprises	63
2.4.1	Human Resource Practices and its Measurability	66
2.4.1.1	Practice of staffing	67
2.4.1.2	Practice of job design	68
2.4.1.3	Practice of training	69
2.4.1.4	Practice of performance appraisal	70
2.4.1.5	Practice of compensation	71
2.4.1.6	Practice of career planning	72
2.5	Conceptualization of framework	72

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1	Introduction	76
3.2	Research framework	76
3.3	Research design	79
3.4	Population and sampling	79
3.4.1	Criteria of the selection of SMEs	83
3.4.2	Sample size of SMEs	84
3.5	Instrumentation	87
3.5.1	Human Resource Practices	88
3.5.2	Organizational Commitment	89
3.5.3	HR Outcomes	89
3.5.4	Classification of demographic variables	89
3.6	Pilotstudy	90
3.6.1	Reliability scores of the variables from pilot test	91
3.6.1.1	Reliability scores of HR practices	91
3.6.1.2	Reliability score of organizational commitment	92
3.6.1.3	Reliability score of HR outcomes	92
3.6.2	Validity scores of the variables from pilot test	93
3.6.2.1	Validity scores of HR practices, organizational commitment and HR outcomes	93

3.7	Methods of data analysis	95
3.7.1	Descriptive analysis	96
3.7.2	Reliability test of actual data	96
3.7.2.1	Reliability score of HR practices	97
3.7.2.2	Reliability score of organizational commitment	98
3.7.2.3	Reliability score of HR outcomes	99
3.7.3	Validity test of actual data	100
3.7.3.1	Factor analysis	102
3.7.3.2	Staffing	102
3.7.3.3	Job/work design	104
3.7.3.4	Training	105
3.7.3.5	Performance appraisal	106
3.7.3.6	Compensation	107
3.7.3.7	Career planning	108
3.7.3.8	Organizational commitment	100
3.7.3.9	HR outcomes	110
3.7.4	Correlation analysis	111
3.7.5	Analysis of Independent-Sample T Test	112
3.7.6	Analysis of One Way ANOVA	112
3.7.7	Regression analysis	113
3.7.7.1	Assumptions for multiple regression analysis	113
3.7.7.2	Assumptions of normality	114
3.7.7.3	Assumption of linearity	115

3.7.7.4	Assumption of heteroscedasticity	115
3.7.7.5	Multicollinearity	116
3.7.7.6	Outliers	116
3.7.8	Multivariate Analysis of Variance MANOVA	117
3.8	Summary of research objectives, research questions, hypotheses and data analysis	117
3.9	Conclusion	120

CHAPTER 4

EMPIRICAL FINDINGS AND PRESENTATION OF THE RESULTS

4.1	Introduction	121
4.2	Sample profile	122
4.2.1	Firm profile	122
4.2.2	Owner/manager profile	130
4.3	Empirical results and examination of the hypotheses	133
4.3.1	Descriptive analysis of HR practices, organizational commitment and HR outcomes and analysis of RQ1	134
4.3.1.1	Staffing	134
4.3.1.2	Job/work design	138
4.3.1.3	Training	140
4.3.1.4	Performance appraisal	141
4.3.1.5	Compensation	143

4.3.3.8 Results of hypothesis eight	174
4.3.4 Analysis of RQ4 and examination of hypotheses	176
4.3.4.1 Test of sectoral differences	177
4.3.4.2 Test of years in exports	183
4.3.4.3 Test of gender in SMEs	185
4.3.4.4 Association of academic qualification and years of operations with HR practices	187
4.3.5 Analysis of RQ5 and examination of hypotheses	193
4.3.5.1 Results of hypothesis seventeen 'a'	194
4.3.5.2 Results of hypothesis seventeen 'b'	196
4.3.5.3 Results of hypothesis eighteen	198
4.4 Discussion and findings of the study	200

CHAPTER 5

DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

5.1 Introduction	205
5.2 Review of the findings	207
5.3 Theoretical contribution	216
5.4 Practical implication	218
5.4.1 Strategic implications for owner/managers	218
5.4.2 Strategic implications for Government	220
5.5 Future direction and research	222

5.6	Conclusion	224
REFERENCES		227
APPENDIX A	Survey Questionnaire	252
APPENDIX B	Normal P-P Plot	261
APPENDIX C	Estimated Marginal Means Plot	271
APPENDIX D	Pictorial Depiction of Research Framework	274
APPENDIX E	Research Publications from the Thesis	279

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE		PAGE
1.1	SMEs categories as per various institutions in Pakistan	10
1.2	Contribution of SME sector	19
1.3	Definition of SMEs in Pakistan	34
2.1	Theoretical Models of HR practices and HR outcomes	49
2.2	Empirical studies of HR practices and HR outcomes	52
3.1	Description of questionnaire	88
3.2	HRP's variables reliability scores(n=46)	91
3.3	KMO and Bartlett's Test results(n=46)	94
3.4	HR practices reliability statistics (n=311)	97
3.5	Organizational commitment reliability statistics (n=311)	98
3.6	HR outcomes reliability statistics (n=311)	99
3.7	KMO and Bartlett's Test results (n=311)	101
3.8	Communalities scores of staffing	103
3.9	Total variance explained in staffing	103
3.10	Communalities scores of job/work design	104
3.11	Total variance explained in job/work design	104
3.12	Communalities scores of training	105
3.13	Total variance explained in training	105
3.14	Communalities scores of performance appraisal	106
3.15	Total variance explained in performance appraisal	107
3.16	Communalities scores of compensation	107

3.17	Total variance explained in compensation	108
3.18	Communalities of career planning	108
3.19	Total variance explained in career planning	108
3.20	Communalities of organizational commitment	109
3.21	Total variance explained in organizational commitment	109
3.22	Communalities of HR outcomes	110
3.23	Total variance explained in HR outcomes	110
3.24	Pearson's r indices of correlation	111
3.25	Overview of RO, RQ, Hypotheses and DA	118
4.1	Firm profile by scale, industry and number of employees	124
4.2	Summary of firms by number of owners & organizations established	125
4.3	Percentage of industries' sub-sectors	126
4.4	Summary of exporting firms, years in exports and depth of operations	127
4.5	Organizations have HR department, HRIS and HR manager	128
4.6	Cross tabulation of Organizations have HR department and HRIS	129
4.7	Cross tabulation of Organizations have HR department and HR manager	129
4.8	Summary of owner/managers profile	133
4.9	Descriptive statistics of staffing	136

UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDID
N IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI F
4.10	Descriptive statistics of job/work design	139
4.11	Descriptive statistics of training	140
4.12	Descriptive statistics of performance appraisal	142
4.13	Descriptive statistics of compensation	145
4.14	Descriptive statistics of career planning	147
4.15	Descriptive statistics of HR practices	149
4.16	Descriptive statistics of organizational commitment	150
4.17	Descriptive statistics of HR outcomes	151
4.18	Hypothesis one - Correlations analysis	155
	Staffing – Organizational commitment – HR outcomes	
4.19	Hypothesis two - Correlations analysis	156
	Job design – Organizational commitment – HR outcomes	
4.20	Hypothesis three - Correlations analysis	158
	Training – Organizational commitment – HR outcomes	
4.21	Hypothesis four - Correlations analysis	159
	Performance appraisal – Organizational commitment –	
	HR outcomes	
4.22	Hypothesis five - Correlations analysis	160
	Compensation – Organizational commitment – HR outcomes	
4.23	Hypothesis six - Correlations analysis	161
	Career planning – Organizational commitment – HR outcomes	
4.24	Hypothesis seven - Correlations analysis	162
	Organizational commitment – HR outcomes	
UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKA
DRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PEN

UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS
UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS
4.25	Test of Multicollinearity		166
4.26	The impact of HR practices on HR outcomes in SMEs		170
4.27	The impact of HR practices on organizational commitment in SMEs		172
4.28	The impact of organizational commitment on HR outcomes in SMEs		173
4.29	The impact of organizational commitment on the relationship between HR practices and HR outcomes in SMEs		175
4.30	Group Statistics- HR practices - Manufacturing and Services SMEs		178
4.31	Group Statistics - Organizational commitment- Manufacturing and Services SMEs		179
4.32	Group Statistics - HR outcomes - Manufacturing and Services SMEs		180
4.33	Group Statistics - HR Practices – Small and Medium Scale firms		182
4.34	Group Statistics - HR Practices – Exporting SMEs		184
4.35	Group Statistics- HR Practices – Gender difference in SMEs		186
4.36	Test of Homogeneity of Variances - Academic Qualification and Human Resource Practices		187
4.37	ANOVA RESULTS – Academics Qualification and HR practices		188
4.38	Multiple Comparisons – Academics Qualification and		188
UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS
UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS	UNIVERSITI PENDIDIKAN SULTAN IDRIS

	HR practices	
4.39	Homogeneous Subsets – Academics Qualification and HR practices	189
4.40	Test of Homogeneity of Variances - Years of operation and Human Resource Practices	190
4.41	ANOVA RESULTS – Years of operation and HR practices	190
4.42	Multiple Comparisons – Years of operation and HR practices	191
4.43	Homogeneous Subsets – Academics Qualification and HR practices	192
4.44	Overall Influence of HR practices on organizational commitment in SMEs	194
4.45	Regression coefficient results for organizational commitment as dependent variable	195
4.46	Overall influence of HR practices on HR outcomes in SMEs	196
4.47	Regression coefficient results for HR outcomes as dependent variable	197
4.48:	Box's Test of Equality of Covariance Matrices	198
4.49:	Multivariate Tests	199
4.50:	Tests of Between-Subjects Effects	199
4.51	Summary of Hypotheses Test	204

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE		PAGE
2.1	The Harvard analytical framework for HRM	46
2.2	Guest’s HRM Model	48
2.3	Proposed conceptual framework	73
3.1	Framework for HRP factors and OC that affect HR Outcomes in SME Sector of Pakistan	78
3.2	Schematic diagram of sample population composition	86
4.1	Scatterplot between standardized residuals of organizational commitment and standardized predicted value of HR practices	167
4.2	Scatterplot between standardized residuals of HRoutcomes and standardized predicted value of HR practices	168

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

EOC	-	Employer of choice
HR department	-	Human Resource department
HR functions	-	Human Resource functions
HR management	-	Human Resource management
HR manager	-	Human Resource manager
HR outcomes	-	Human Resource outcomes
HR practices	-	Human Resource practices
HR professional	-	Human Resource professional
HR	-	Human Resource
HRIS	-	Human Resource Information System
HRM	-	Human Resource Management
SME	-	Small and Medium Enterprise
SMEDA	-	Smalland Medium Enterprise Development Authority

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

This thesis is broadly concerned with human resource practices (HR practices) that influence organizational commitment and shapes the human resource outcomes (HR outcomes) in the SMEs. It highlights the relationships between how problem statement and research questions related to the HR practices, organizational commitment and HR outcomes in the small and medium enterprises (SMEs) of Pakistan. Specifically, it investigates the way in which such enterprises implement and practice human resource activities to ensure the commitment of employees, which ultimately contributes to the HR outcomes. Chapter one intends to present a description about the background of the study. Problem statement, research objectives, research questions and hypotheses are presented in this chapter. Thus this

chapter helps to identify operationalization for research, discussed in the available literature of HR practice.

1.1 Introduction

In current epoch organizations are persistently facing the innovative challenges to substantiate their position in the business world. They are supposed to respond swiftly to technological changes, global competition, deregulation, and rapid demographic changes. The unrestrained business environment limits the option for business processes efficiencies, and on the counterpart, retention, competencies and commitment of employee is become one of the emerging challenges facing by many business organizations. This issue become more crucial in small and medium enterprises (SME).

Many studies found that retention, competencies and commitment of employees, are recognize as a vital for the achievement of organizational goals (Chew & Chan, 2008; Falkenburg&Schyns 2007; Zheng, Morrison & Neill, 2006; Osman, Ho&Galang, 2011). Organizations are now striving to be the “employer of choice”. According to Clarke (2001) ‘employer of choice’ (EOC) is an organization that outperforms its competition in the attraction, development and retention of people with business-required aptitude, often through innovative and compelling human resource programs. Organizations are assumed to creating a likeable and competitive working environment. They offer challenging assignments that foster personal growth. Incorporation of these elements in structure, enable organizations, to perform well in

terms of employee relationship. Hence they are considered as a preferred employer or employer of choice, while making employment decision by a potential employee.

Essentially more organizations are now realizing the significance of employees and consider it as a strategic issue, hence, adaptation of effective HR practices program may provide an edge for organizational sustainability and regarded as a competitive advantage in the business.

1.2 Overview of the socio-economic condition of Pakistan

Small and medium sized enterprises represent a large, diverse and important sector worldwide and considered as the most significant sector which contributes in the development of a country. In recent years the small and medium sized enterprises (SME) have come under “public policy limelight” (Schlogl, 2004) and get attention of the policy makers of developed and developing countries. According to the figures and facts provided by the UNIDO, 90 percent business worldwide are fall into the category of SME sector and it provide approximately 60 percent employments around the world.

Analysing the significance of SME sector worldwide and its importance into the country’s economy it can be inferred that SME sector plays a vital role in developing the Pakistan’s economy.

Islamic Republic of Pakistan got independence in 1947 from British India. Pakistan follows the Federal Republic Government system. It has four provinces which include Sindh, Punjab, Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and one territory Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and one capital territory Islamabad. Pakistan follows common law system with Islamic law influence. It has joint electorates and reserved parliamentary seats for women and non-Muslims. President of the country holds the position of Chief of the State and Prime Minister is the Head of the Government. The Cabinet appointed by the President of Pakistan upon the advice of the Prime Minister of the country. The President elected through an Electoral College comprising the members of the Senate, National Assembly, and Provincial Assemblies for a five-year term. Majlis-e-Shoora consists of the Senate and the National Assembly.

Pakistan is situated in the Southern Asian region bordering with India on the east and Iran and Afghanistan on the west and China in the north. The total area of the country is 796,095 sq km, it has four seasons, and mostly the weather is hot and dry. Pakistan has extensive natural gas reserves. Pakistan is basically an agriculture country with the irrigated land field of 198,700 sq km.

Pakistan is a 6th most populated country in the world with the population of 190.29 million. Muslims are in majority with the ratio of 95 percent and rest of the population include Christian and Hindu. Urdu is the national languages of the country and English is the official language of Pakistan, moreover, more than eleven languages are widely spoken in the different areas of the country. The literacy rate of the country is 49.9 percent with educational expenditure of 2.7 percent of total GDP.

Pakistan is a developing country and mostly the economy based on agricultural activities. However country substantially shifted to industrial activities as well. Textiles industry is one of the most prominent sectors in the country and account for most of Pakistan's export earnings. The total labour force in Pakistan is 58.41 million with the unemployment rate of 5.6 percent. Agriculture sector engaged the majority of workforce with the proportion of 45 percent; moreover, industry and service sector employed 20.1 percent and 34.9 percent respectively with per capita income of USD 2800. The major agricultural products include cotton, wheat, rice, sugarcane, fruits, vegetables; milk, beef, mutton and eggs. Moreover, the industrial sector of Pakistan comprises of textiles and apparel, food processing, pharmaceuticals, construction materials, paper products and fertilizer.

1.3 SME sector and Human Resource Practices in Pakistan

1.3.1 Small and Medium Scale Firms in Pakistan

The Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) are playing vital role in the economies around the world in irrespective of the countries development stage (Dasanayaka, 2008). SMEs are now considered as the foremost source of economic growth. However, due to dynamic environment and globalization, SMEs are struggling harder to survive. In Pakistan there are about 90 percent of enterprises fall under the category of SME (SMEDA, 2006) therefore Pakistan can be considered as a SME driven economy. According to the Federal Bureau of Statistic data 65 percent enterprises are